

**„Babeş-Bolyai” university, Faculty of History and Philosophy,
Specialization : Philosophy**

PhD thesis

Corporality and intersubjectivity

**Scientific leader :
University teacher dr. Virgil Ciomoş**

**PhD Candidate :
Alina-Daniela Ciric**

**Cluj-Napoca
2019**

Content

Introduction	5
Argument	8

FIRST PART

STARTING FROM FENOMENOLOGY: HUSSERL ȘI LEVINAS

Chapter I. The husserlian thinking and the start of the Levinasian ethics	10
1.1 The premises of an ethical interpretation of the other.....	10
1.2 The path to the other or the original passivity of an original affection.....	14
1.3 Conscious life and the transitive structure of life.....	17
1.4 The sensitivity beyond the noetic-noematic correlation.....	20
1.5 Passive Synthesis and the dimension of the Affect: Call and Response	22
1.6 Sensitive formation of the phenomenological time.....	26
1.7 Original impression and sensual intent	34
1.8 Leib-Korper	45
Chapter II. Ways to access alterity in Husserlian phenomenology	47
2.1 Accesing the object	48
2.2 Intentionality and sensible perception.....	62
2.3 Going towards the Other	67
Chapter III. Intersubjectivity in husserlian pehnomenology	80
Capitolul IV Intersubjectivity in the fifth Cartezian Meditation.	
A levinasian point of view	107
Chapter V. Corporality and intersubjectivity	120
5.1 Corporality in Husserl's phenomenology	120
5.2 A new sensitivity. Towards a intentionality of the sensibility	124

5.3 Body and movement.....	134
5.4 On the Other's intentionality.....	142

**SECOND PART
BEYOND PHENOMENOLOGY:**

Chapter VI. The path of a phenomenology of a sensitive subject to an ethic of transcendence	149
Chapter VII. The life of the subject and the intentionality of juisance	168
7.1 The concept of the world. Heidegger și Levinas.....	168
7.2 Juisance and world	173
7.3 Interiority and economy	176
7.4 Nurture and juisance.....	178
7.5 The other as a pole of introducing another meaning.Redefining the sense of consciousness in relation to the pre-reflexive area of the body	183
7.6 Final considerations.....	188
Conclusions.....	196
Bibliography	198

Used abbreviations :

AE - *Autrement qu'être ou au-delà de l'essence*, Martinus Nijhoff, 1978 – Emmanuel Levinas

DMT - *Dieu, la mort et le temps*, Editions Grasset et Fasquelle, Paris, 1993 -Emmanuel Levinas

EDE - *En découvrant l'existence avec Husserl et Heidegger*, Librairie Philosophique J.Vrin, Paris, 1988 - Emmanuel Levinas

EE - *De l'existence à l'existant*, Librairie Philosophique J.Vrin, Paris, 1990 -Emmanuel Levinas

EJ - *Expérience et jugement*, PUF, Paris, 1970 - Edmund Husserl

EN - *Entre nous. Essais sur le penser-à-l'autre*, Editions Grasset et Fasquelle, Paris, 1991 - Emmanuel Levinas

HAH - *Humanisme de l'autre homme*, Fata Morgana, Montpellier, 1972 - Emmanuel Levinas

MP - *Méditations phénoménologiques*, Jérôme Millon, Grenoble, 1992 - Marc Richir

TI - *Totalité et infini. Essai sur l'extériorité*, Martinus Nijhoff, La Haye, 1971 - Emmanuel Levinas

Keywords: ethics, alterity, subjectivity, consciousness, subject, corporeality, intersubjectivity, pre-reflexive, phenomenology, meaning-making, egology.

The theme of my research is the clarification of the status of alterity in contemporary philosophy, especially in Husserlian phenomenology, where it is condemned to a secondary being, as a result of the constitutive activity of the transcendental subject. This will prove not only the possibility of an ethical relationship with it but also the revelation of another type of sensitivity that accompanies it.

I will try to show how the possibility of pursuing this logic of a different subject is sustainable only through the hermeneutics of the Levinassian texts in which, as we will see, subtle phenomenological games come to the surface.

The attempt to clarify the type of sensitivity that the other subject involves starts with questioning its phenomenological source. Our work will be divided into two major parts, in the first part we will try to clarify the essential aspects of Husserlian thinking which later will led to overcoming of phenomenology towards an ethics of subjectivity. Thus, the first chapter of our paper will be devoted to the research of the phenomenological sources of the Levinassian thought, followed by a reconstruction of the Husserline phenomenology in a Levinasian key.

The reconstruction of this reading will assess the phenomenological sensitivity as phasing, diachronicity, alterity, clues by which sensitivity is described and which will constitute its phenomenon. Behind these clues, we guess the presence of sensitivity. The "emergence" of sensitivity will not prove its origin as the result of a meaning-making, as we will detail in the chapters related to this subject.

Even if we are talking about the phenomenon of sensitivity, it does not appear as an event resulting from the attribution of a meaning. Paradoxically, its phenomenological specificity will be precisely in its non-constitutional status. From this non-constituted position, sensibility will then weave its own phenomenalization. It appears as an alterity that invades the Same.

Thus, a new ontological perspective of the transcendental is outlined, in which being is no longer just correlative to thought, but is already founding the very thought.

This distinct concept of transcendental originally appears in the interpretations Levinas made to the concept of sensitive experience in Husserl's work. Although in Kant, the transcendental refers to the conditions of possibility of knowledge that escape any form of experience being

what makes the experience possible, Husserl appears to have developed a transcendental experience that ultimately legitimizes knowledge. One of the issues that arise here is given by maintaining a meaning of being that can be given to transcendence, while maintaining the phenomenological epoche. But for Levinas, the subject is no longer a pure subject at this stage. About this mutual conditioning between constituted and constituent of the transcendental, starting from the Husserlian sensitive experience, several theses in *Totalité et Infini* have developed. As we will see, this is the case of sensitive experience, because this is the land where the ambiguity of the constitution appears, where the husserlian *noema* conditions the *noesis* that it constitutes. It is thus at Levinas to think radically of the existence of a subject on its own, taking into account the idea of responsibility that will then open to a phenomenology of language.

Thus, what Levinas proposes, the thought of a radical alterity that transcends any identification report, requires as a general condition a radical re-thinking of subjectivity. The Levinasian ego will appear defined by self-constitution of its identity, and its own subjectivity will be found in this infinite idea. We will show how this double report, as the production of the infinite from the ego and as the founding of the ego in the infinite idea, demands, in our own work, an exodus of itself, an overcoming of subjectivity. We will then detail what appears to us to be the key to the ontological dimension of Levinasian phenomenology: alterity is only possible starting with the self because it is only because of it that the event of being can take place. What makes it possible to relate to the Other is the essential idea that subjectivity will remain separate. A separate subjectivity implies that it is no longer universal. A universal character would mean that it would no longer be an individuality, which would make it impossible to relate to alterity. Just thinking in terms of separation, subjectivity makes transcendence possible. These are just a few of the theses that we will develop in the first part of our work, ultimately advancing to the analysis of the fundamental emotional mood for Levinas, which is the *juisance*, characterized by a transcendental status as it is shown, in a constitutive manner in the constituent itself. *Juisance* will allow precisely this transcendental to expand upon the plan of the sensible. In this sense, as we shall see in the second part of our work, the exteriority of the body is not constituted, but assumed, this signifying the inscription of the transcendental Levinasian into the bodily being.

The relationship with the transcendental in this sense will have a temporal meaning. This specific temporal sense will arise when we contrast, as we will see in the chapter dedicated to this subject, the intentionality of representation and the intentionality specific to this juisance. As reading the Levinasian ethics in the key of a new sensibility, I wanted, first of all, to resist this thinking of its phenomenological ties. As different as the Husserlian phenomenology is sometimes, Levinas's philosophy remains a constant exercise of dialogue with Edmund Husserl's thinking and post-husserline philosophies. It is precisely in the complexity of this dialogue that Levinas' phenomenology is formed.

Through the intermediation of other concepts of phenomenological sensitivity (proto-impression in the formation of immanent time or kinestheses in the constitution of space), Levinas allows the creation of a sense other than that which the Same gives to the Other. The structure of The other-in-The Same describes the way in which sensibility is phenomenizing.

The logic of this other concept of sensibility is to show, as we have seen in Husserl, that the Other becomes a possibility to create the same. This phenomenization is present in concepts such as alterity, sensitivity or diachronicity. But those at Husserl are no longer clues to an ethics. As we have already analyzed, for Husserl, they are the index of a phenomenological alterity whose specificity is directed towards the analyzes of passivity of consciousness.

It is precisely this passivity that appears as the meeting point of intentional and hyletic moment. At this point, sensitivity seems compromised to the work of constitution, as having a destiny that does not belong to it. But precisely by conceiving sensitivity as an asymmetry, Levinas proves the ethical dimension. The other is one of the ways, perhaps the most important, through which, in this logic of sensibility, a sense of meaning can be formed.

Trying to remain faithful to this first non-apolitical intention of our thesis, we have tried to capitalize on Levinasian comments and the hermeneutical meanings Levinas has on Husserl's work. Of these, the leading thread of our thesis was precisely the notion of sensitivity with whom Levinas went much further than the Husserlian developments. A first moment of this process is visible in the analysis of juisance, a type of consumer sensitivity that is producing my economic world, my world of possessions. These possessions that describe my economic world are questioned by the other, hence the birth of ethics. If the sensitivity seen as juisance is the one that produces my own possessions and if the other is the one that questions them, then I see the limits of my own sensitivity.

This exposure to the Other reveals a sensitivity that is revealed from the beginning as being invested by the Other. This is about a sensitivity whose origin lies in establishing contact with the Other. The paroxysm of this ethical process will lead to the onset of another type of sensibility, which is no longer a prisoner of the noetic-noematic structure. This ethical sensitivity will lead to the creation of a new meaning, culminating with the onset of otherness.

The last considerations about Levinas' phenomenology have given us the opportunity to analyze the ethical openness that every physical experience of incarnate subjectivity carries in itself. We have tried in our work to follow, in terms of corporality, the same triad that phenomenology itself has experienced, from the transcendental approach of phenomena to the ontological and then ethical one.

Bibliography

Main bibliography-Emmanuel Levinas's works

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Autrement qu'être ou au-delà de l'essence*, Martinus Nijhoff, 1978

Levinas, Emmanuel, *De Dieu qui vient à l'idée*, Librairie Philosophique J.Vrin, Paris, 1992

Levinas, Emmanuel, *De l'existence à l'existant*, Librairie Philosophique J.Vrin, Paris, 1990

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Dieu, la mort et le temps*, Editions Grasset et Fasquelle, Paris, 1993

Levinas, Emmanuel, *En découvrant l'existence avec Husserl et Heidegger*, Librairie Philosophique J.Vrin, Paris, 1988

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Entre nous. Essais sur le penser-à-l'autre*, Editions Grasset et Fasquelle, Paris, 1991

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Hors sujet*, Fata Morgana, Montpellier, 1987

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Humanisme de l'autre homme*, Fata Morgana, Montpellier, 1972

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Le temps et l'autre*, Fata Morgana, Paris, 1979

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Théorie de l'intuition dans la phénoménologie de Husserl*, Vrin, 1994.

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Totalité et infini. Essai sur l'extériorité*, M .Nijhoff, La Haye, 1971

Levinas, Emmanuel, *Transcendance et intelligibilité*, Labor et Fidès, Genève, 1984

Secondary bibliography:

Calin Rodolphe, Sebbah François-David, *Le vocabulaire de Lévinas*, Ellipses, Paris, 2002

Barbaras Renaud, *Introduction à la philosophie de Husserl*, La transparence, Chatou France, 2004

Barbaras Renaud, « Le corps et la chair dans la troisième partie de *L'Être et le Néant*, in : *Sartre et la phénoménologie*, , ENS éditions, Fontenay /Saint-Cloud, 2000

Ciocan Cristian, Hansel Georges, *Lévinas concordance*, Springer, Netherlands, 2005

Ciocan Cristian, *Întruchipări. Studiu de fenomenologie a corporalității*, Humanitas, București, 2013

Ciomoș Virgil, *De la experiența sublimului la starea de excepție*, ediția a II-a, Ed. Paideia, 2006

Critchley, S. *Ethics, Politics, Subjectivity. Essays on Derrida, Levinas and Contemporary French Philosophy*, Verso, New York, 1999

Dastur Françoise, « Réduction et intersubjectivité », Husserl, Eliane Escoubas et Marc Richir. Millon, Grenoble, 2004.

Depraz Natalie, *Transcendance et incarnation. Le statut de l'intersubjectivité comme altérité à soi chez Husserl*, Vrin, Paris, 1995

Depraz Natalie, *Lucidité du corps De l'empirisme transcendantal en phénoménologie*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht / Boston, London, 2001

De Bauw Christine, *L'envers du sujet. Lire autrement Lévinas*, Ousia, 1997

Derrida Jacques, *Violence et Métaphysique : L'écriture et la différence*. Editions du Seuil, Essai. France, 1979

Derrida Jacques, *En ce moment même dans cet ouvrage me voici : Textes pour Emmanuel Lévinas*, Collection Surfaces, vol. N° 2, Jean-Michel Place, Paris, 1980

Derrida Jacques, *Adieu à Emmanuel Lévinas*, Galilée, Paris, 1997

Durrati A, *Husserl. Intersubjectivity and antropology*, University of California, California, 2006

Janicaud Dominique, *Le tournant théologique de la phénoménologie française*, Editions de l'éclat, collection « Tiré à part », France, 1991.

Franck Didier, *Chair et corps Sur la phénoménologie de Husserl*, Les éditions de minuit, Paris, 1981

Fink, Eugen – *De la phénoménologie*, Les Editions de Minuit, Paris, 1974

Granel Gérard, *Le sens du temps et de la perception chez Husserl*, Gallimard, Paris, 1968

Habib Stéphane, *La responsabilité chez Sartre et Lévinas*, L'Harmattan, 1998

Heidegger Martin, *Les problèmes fondamentaux de la phénoménologie. Section II. Cours 1923-1944*, Gallimard, Paris, 1985

Heidegger Martin, *Etre et Temps*, trad. Emmanuel Martineau, Authentica, 1985

Husserl Edmond, *Idées directrices pour une phénoménologie et une philosophie phénoménologique pures*, tome premier : *Introduction générale à la phénoménologie pure*, (Idées I), Gallimard, Paris, 1985

Husserl Edmond, *Idées directrices pour une phénoménologie et une philosophie phénoménologiques pures, : Recherches phénoménologiques pour la constitution* (Idées II), PUF, Paris, 1982

Husserl, Edmund, *Zur Phänomenologie der Intersubjektivität: Texte aus dem Nachlass Zweiter Teil: 1921-1928 (Husserliana: Edmund Husserl - Gesammelte Werke) (German Edition) (German) 1973rd Edition*

Husserl Edmond, *L'idée de la phénoménologie cinq leçons*, PUF, Paris, 1970

Husserl Edmond, *Méditations cartésiennes*, Vrin, Paris, 2001.

Husserl Edmond, *Leçons pour une phénoménologie de la conscience intime du temps*,

Husserl Edmond, *De la synthèse passive. Logique transcendantale et constitutions originaires*, Millon, Grenoble, 1998, p.217, Paris, 1964

Kant, Immanuel – *Critica rațiunii pure*, Editura Iri, București, 1995

Kassis, Raymond, *De la phénoménologie à la métaphysique*, Jérôme Millon, Millon, 2002

Kearney, R. « De la phénoménologie à l'éthique. Entretien avec Emmanuel Lévinas », *Esprit*, N°234, Juillet, 1997

Kessel Marc, *Eros and Ethics*, Reading Jacques Lacan Seventh Seminar, Suny Series, 2007

Langrebe, Ludwig, *The Phenomenology of Edmund Husserl*, ed. D. Welton, Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1981

Lavigne Jean-François (éd.) – *Les Méditations cartésiennes de Husserl*, Librairie Philosophique J. Vrin, Paris, 2008

Lescourret Marie-Anne, *Emmanuel Lévinas*, Flammarion, France, 1994

Liotard Jean-François, « Logique de Lévinas » *Textes pour Emmanuel Lévinas*, vol. N° 2, Jean-Michel Place, Paris, 1980

Marinca Sorin, *Realul și idealul în fenomenologia husserliană*, Studia PHILOSOPHICA, XLIX,1-2,2004

Merleau-Ponty Maurice, *Phénoménologie de la perception*, Gallimard, Paris, 1945

Montavont Anne, *De la passivité dans la phénoménologie de Husserl*, Epiméthée, PUF, Paris, 1999

Pariskami Yasuhiko, *Lévinas phénoménologue*, Millon, Grenoble, 2002

Patočka Jean, *Introduction à la phénoménologie de Husserl*, collection Krisis, Millon, Grenoble, 1992

Ponty, Maurice-Merleau – *Le visible et l'invisible*, Gallimard, Paris, 2004

The Cambridge Companion to Levinas, ed. S.Critchley, L. Bernasconi, Cambridge University Press, 2004

The Cambridge Companion to Melanie Klein, Cambridge University Press, 2000

Ricoeur Paul, *Autrement. Lecture d'autrement qu'être ou au-delà de l'essence d'Emmanuel Lévinas*, PUF, 1997

Ricoeur Paul, *A l'école de la phénoménologie*, Vrin, Paris, 1993

Schnell, Alexander, *En Face de L'Extériorité: Levinas Et la Question de la Subjectivité*, Vrin, Paris, 2010

Zahavi, Dan, *The new Husserl, A critical Reader*, Studies in Continental thought, University Press of Copenhagen, 2003

Wiercînsky A., *Between description and Interpretationon. The hermeneutic turn in Phenomenology*, Suny Series, 2007

Articles :

Abensour Miguel, *Penser l'utopie autrement*, *Cahier de l'Herne. Emmanuel Lévinas*, Editions del'Herne, Paris, 1991

Fleurdeliz R., Altez A., *Body and transcendence in Emmanuel Levinas Phenomenological ethics*, *Kritike*, vol 5, Nr 1, 2011

Heidegger Martin, *Les problèmes fondamentaux de la phénoménologie. Section II. Cours 1923-1944*, Gallimard, Paris, 1985

Mayzard, Yves, *Language and Langue chez Husserl et Levinas*, *Studia Phenomenologica*, A century with Levinas. Notes on the margins of his legacy. ed. Cristian Ciocan, vol. VI, Humanitas, Bucuresti, 2006, pp 139-153

Marinca, Sorin, *Realul și idealul în fenomenologia husserliană*, Studia Philosophica, XLIX,1-2,2004

Szigeti, Attila, *Dire ce que ne peut pas être dit. La Phénoménologie du langage de Levinas dans Autrement que être au della de l'essence*, Studia Philosophia XLIX 1-2 2004

Montavont Anne, « Passivité et non-donation », dans *Alter Revue de Phénoménologie*, n°1,

Montavont Anne, « Le phénomène de l'affection dans les *analysen zur passiven synthesis* », *Alter Revue de Phénoménologie*, n°2, « Temporalité et affection »,

Zahavi, Dan, *Intersubjective transformation of transcendental philosophy*, http://cfs.ku.dk/staff/zahavipublications/husserl_s_20transformation_20of_20transcendental_20philosophy.pdf/

Schnell, A, *Intersubjectivity in Husserl work*, Meta, Research in Hermeneutics, Phenomenology and Practical Philosophy II (1) 2010

Online sources:

<https://popups.uliege.be/0774-7136/index.php?id=364>

<https://www.univie.ac.at/constructivism/pub/mutelesi/1.html>

