

Babeş-Bolyai University
Faculty of European Studies

Summary of the theses

"(NATIONAL) ETHNIC AND OTHER IDENTITIES-THEIR ROLE AND INFLUENCE
ON THE SECURITY SECTOR"

Ph.D. Student : TABATADZE Dato

Scientific coordinator professor PĂUN Nicolae

12 June 2017

Cluj-Napoca

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	4
Keywords.....	5
Abbreviations.....	5
Chapter 1.....	6
1. Introduction	6
1.1 Methodology.....	12
1.2. Ethnic Identities and Their impact on Security Sector - literature Review.....	13
1.3. Literature Review - Identities.....	21
1.4. Creation of Identities and Classification.....	24
Chapter II.....	32
2. CASE STUDY 1: GEORGIA.....	32
2.1. Introduction and Methodology.....	32
2.1.1. Theory and Methodology.....	34
2.2. Identity Groups: analyses of ethnic conflicts in Georgia in 1990s and in 2008...35	
2.2.1. History:	36
2.2.2. Eruption of military clashes.....	47
2.2.3. Identity Groups:	50
2.2.4. NATO Stance:	54
2.2.5. Conclusion	59
2.3. The role of Religion in the creation of the identities and its influence on the security sector	64
2.3.1. Conclusion-A comparison of the security risks and challenges in Georgia,	

in the 1990s and at present:	85
CHAPTER III.....	86
3. Variables.....	86
3.1. Defining the variables and the Russian Federation as a variable.....	86
3.2. Dichotomy between domestic and foreign policy?.....	88
3.3. Independent, depended and the third variables.....	96
3.3.1. South Ossetian Geography and Demographics.....	103
3.3.2. Third Variable- Russian Federation.....	108
3.4. Conclusions.....	121
CHAPTER IV.....	127
4. Looking for the Security Sector Theory	127
4.1. Introduction.....	127
4.2. Broadening the Security Studies - Analyses of Security Sectors.....	157
4.2.1. Environmental Security Sector.....	160
4.2.2. Societal Security.....	167
CHAPTER V.....	169
5. Case Studies of Ukraine and Republic of Moldova.....	169
5.1. Russia's hybrid war in Ukraine and the contribution of National Identities in it.....	169
5.2. Defining hybrid war and unfolding its main features.....	179
5.2.1. Short case Study of Akhagori District	194
5.3. Religion As the instrument of creation new national identities and as the independent player in the hybrid war.....	207
5.4. Societal Security Theory and the analyses of the ethno-national	

component of the conflict in Ukraine.....	213
5.4.1. The Orange Revolution and the Yushchenko presidency.....	214
5.4.2. Euromaidan - the beginning of the second phase of Russia's hybrid war in Ukraine.....	217
5.5. Case Study of Moldova.....	226
5.5.1. THE HISTORY OF THE REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	228
5.5.2. Transnistria.....	232
CHAPTER VI.....	236
Final Conclusions of the Dissertation.....	236

Keywords: Identities, Security Sector, International Relations Theory, Constructivism, Neorealism, Classical Realism, Black Sea Region, Georgia, Republic of Moldova, Ukraine.

In the current moment my theses: "(NATIONAL) ETHNIC AND OTHER IDENTITIES- THEIR ROLE AND INFLUENCE ON THE SECURITY SECTOR" is already complete.

characteristics of the theses: it is interdisciplinary research project and the challenge is not to be overstretched .

Goals to define what kind of influences can identities have on security sector.

methodology: comparative method, case studies, literature analyze.

project obligations: participation in a conference, publishing two articles, teaching, attending obligatory subjects, and theses. All these obligations are accomplished by now.

After the Collapse of Soviet Union in 1990s many ethnic conflicts were erupted as a result of the disappearance the central soviet government which were controlling all the nations inside the Soviet Union. it was believed that these conflicts did not have only the ethnic grounds and was mainly encouraged from outside for weakening the post soviet republics so that to be controlled by the Russian Federation which was the official successor of Soviet Union and was trying to keep the newly independent countries in its orbit of influence. primary these conflict were considered as the ethnic conflicts stemming from the filling of insecurity by the ethnic minority groups or otherwise ethnic identity groups who wanted to stay in Soviet Union or become independent from the countries they resided in. this research project asks: what kind of an influence can these identities have on the security sector of the countries where they reside? what a degree can of impact can these identities produce? Were these conflicts only ethnic or the outside force played also a role in it? these are the questions that the current research tries to answer and in order to see importance and actuality of such a questions a small geopolitical review will be useful: for answering these questions three case studies were selected(about the selection criteria see the discussion below) that are as follow: Georgia, Republic of Moldova and Ukraine. If the reader search these countries on the map he/she

will see that all of them are the Black Sea region countries and all of them are post-Soviet newly independent countries which tries to define themselves in a changing world. Black Sea region encompasses also NATO an European Union countries and the peace and sustainable development in its neighboring countries is vital. Finding the answers to the above mentioned research questions can contribute in future peace-building in the region. The importance of such a research can be seen from the fact that this research will provide not only the answers to the unique cases but it will produce a kind of knowledge which can be generalized to the similar cases in the post soviet countries.

In order to define why does these kinds of conflicts occur ongoing research has studied two phenomena and their attitudes to each other. These phenomena are as follow: first ethnic and religious identities and their behaviour was explained by their interests and for defining these interests of identities Social Constructivism was utilized. The religious component was also studied deeply together with the ethnic because religion and nationalism both has the ability to create a strong identity and define their interests. Second notion what was deeply studied was security sector: it was studies as at the local level as well on the international and it was agreed that on both levels are very intertwined and are very much depended on each other. Sometimes it is domestic security issue that has impact on the international level and in the other case *vice versa* . In addition to this Security Studies as a sub-field of the International Relations was thoroughly reviewed and the new development in the field was upheld as the useful theories for the explanation the notions and events consisted by the current research. For example the security sector of Georgia is vulnerable to the challenges coming from the ethnic minority groups if these minorities trying to separate the territory where they live from Georgia. The Social security theory can help to explain the reasons of such a behaviour of ethnic identities to claim that the social group itself can be a referent object that means the object/value what should be saved and when they feel the danger as a society in a state where they are located they tend to answer with self organization and this triggers action-reaction cycles which is called social security dilemma that

culminates in the military conflict. This research inquires the attitudes of two notions: First Security Sector which is represented here as an dependent variable and ethnic identities as independent variable. But there is the third variable too which is called outside force this is the independent variable which has the influence not only on the dependent variable - the security sector of a country but also on the independent variable-identity groups and in this way it makes the simultaneously as an intermediate variable. So the research have independent, intermediate and dependent variables.

To mention again the main research question of my research is: **what kind of influence/impact can identities have on the security sector of the state and how can it be managed?** To find out the answer(s) to this question it was argued by me in the main hypotheses that: **every state's society has different groups of people who identify themselves within the different groups according to religion, ethnic origins or the other characteristics. These are called identities. Different identities can have as positive as well negative influence on the security sector of the state. This is depended to the policy and the quality of the government of a state and also to the outside factors as on the regional as well on the system level.**

The research was started with the introduction chapter where the methods of the research were presented. Because of the specificities and necessities of the research project the following methods were utilised: First specialty is connected to the research question. it demands type of answer(s) that could be generalized to the similar situations and notions. This was the reason why three case studies were chosen so that to show the general similar dynamics and receive similar results if not the same. Although it was possible to discover the important differences between the mentioned case studies but the hypotheses would be proved if these differences were not the fundamental and instead the similarities would be the ones. The case studies were selected very carefully according to the claimed fundamental similarities which would depict and then generalized received results as the general trend or characteristic of similar cases with

similar actors and notions. To receive wanted answers to the main research question Comparison of both similarities and differences was selected as a main research method. This method has several characteristics and possibilities that makes it one of the suitable research method for the current research project. First: not only was it used to find out the similarities and differences of the different cases or notions operating in same period of the time but it gives the opportunity to the researcher to make a longitudinal comparison this means to compare 2 similar cases that existed in different period of time. this can be used to forecast what kind of policy can one variable have in the current case if it uses the similar methods and policy what it used to do in past case. This happened in the case study of Georgia when the ethnic conflicts in Georgia in 1990s was compared to the current conflicts in Ukraine's Donetsk and Luhansk regions. After the detailed analyses and comparison of the facts it was concluded that because Russia has the same interests in Ukraine now as it had in 1990s in Georgia which is to keep the imperial influence on post Soviet Union countries and because the methods of supporting the separatist movements was the very similar in these two cases it became clear that this is the general policy of Russia which was recognised as one of the variable of this research project and the past experience of Georgia is a good guideline for constructing the future policy towards the conflict zones and towards the Russian Federation itself. During these comparison of case studies a large amount of empirical and other type of information was observed and analysed which stemmed from the different type of sources such as documents of different organizations, books, published interviews, scientific articles, press and online sources. These sources which are included in the reference list were analyzed by the another research method called literature review which was used throughout the different chapters of the ongoing dissertation. In addition to these methods. Authors own observations and travelling in the conflict zone, refugee settlements and other places in Georgia was also used as the research method and as the mean of fact findings. As it can be seen from the list of source research project consists

primary and secondary sources that are quite balanced according to their proportions in the dissertation.

Hypotheses is empirical and general because first: it is about the existing conflicts and a big part of the data gathered and used is real facts that happened or happening now and the theories of International Relations and Security Studies are used to analyze and explain these facts.

Second: the hypotheses is general at the same time because it is about the general behaviour and characteristics of ethnic and religious identities. This means that the hypotheses can be generalized to the other similar cases. About the validity of the hypotheses can be said that according to the results received from the dissertation the suggestions of it are proved and can be verified by the real case studies implemented during the research process. All the above mentioned gives the opportunity to claim that the hypotheses of the dissertation is valid. To add the hypotheses tries to explain the trend of ethnic conflicts which erupted in post soviet countries and is kept and modified up to present.

The next issue what is discussed is about the methods of the data gathering to implement the necessary observations. Observations are valid because they are grounded on the real empirical data which was gathered during the three case studies implemented in frames of the current research project. The empirical data analyze was used for measurement of the behaviour of the variables. These empirical data comes from the books, official documents, scientific articles, press sources and online sources. These data was analyze by the different tools such as International Relation theories, different security theories and frameworks of analyses.

In the hypotheses there are three units of analyses first was the ethnic identities on the local level and second: the security sector of the state at the same level. The third unite of analyses is the outside force-a country(Russian federation) which has effect on the other units of analyses. In all three case studies (Georgia, Republic of Moldova and Ukraine) the

observations are made on the same units of the analyses what are represented in the main hypotheses. For example in case of Georgia ethnic identity groups which were observed were ethnic Ossetians and ethnic Abkhazians who were demanding the separation from the Georgia which can be considered as the threat to the second unit of analyze-the security sector of Georgia. And the last unit of analyze-the outside factor in case of Georgia as in all other cases-was Russian Federation. same situation is in rest of the cases: In Republic of Moldova ethnic Gagauzians who residing in Autonomous republic of Gagauzia and ethnic minorities living in Transnistria are the first unite of analyses which is ethnic identities. Second unit of analyses is the security sector of Republic of Moldova and the third Russian Federation as we already mention is the same for all case study countries. In Ukraine unites of analyses are as follow: ethnic Russians as minority group, the security sector of Ukraine and Russian Federation.

The whole research project is dedicated to contribute in the development of the knowledge about the ethnic identities and security sector of the state.