

**BABEŞ-BOLYAI UNIVERSITY
CLUJ-NAPOCA
FACULTY OF HISTORY AND PHILOSOPHY
DOCTORAL SCHOOL IN PHILOSOPHY**

***The Connection Between Narratives and Identity in the
Process of Communication***

An Interdisciplinary and Philosophical Approach

PhD THESIS

SUMMARY

**Doctoral supervisor:
Prof. univ. dr. Veress Carol**

**PhD candidate:
SzávaCsanád**

2014

Content

Introduction	6
Delimiting the Topic	6
The Structure of the Work.....	10
Methods of Research.....	14
1. Identity and experience	16
1.1 On Identity	16
1.1.1 Different Scientific Concepts of Identity	17
1.1.2 Identity as a Philosophical Problem	21
1.1.3 Narrative Identity.....	24
1.2 On the Concept of Experience	29
1.2.1 Negativity and Reversibility	29
1.2.2 The New and the Opened.....	37
1.2.3 Limits and Historic Determination	39
2. Life–Story–To Tell.....	46
2.1 The Idiographic Life Story	46
2.2 The Philosophical Life Story	49
2.2.1 Life as Enacted–Life as a Story.....	50
2.2.2 Experience of Life and Sense.....	54
2.2.3 The Unity of Life and Story	56
2.3 Text and Expression	61
2.3.1 Fiction and Imaginary	61
2.3.2 Imitating and Change.....	64
2.3.3 Writing – Reading – Interpretation.....	65
3. Narrative as Communication	71
3.1 Communication and History	72
3.1.1 Story and Communication	72
3.1.2 Understanding and History	74
3.1.3 Understanding the Historical.....	78
3.2 Memory and History	80
3.2.1 Remembering and Oral History	81
3.2.2 „Could” and „Hot” Memory	82
3.2.3 Historical Narratives	84
3.3 Memory and Communication	88
3.3.1 Time and Communication.....	88
3.3.2 Individual and Collective Memory.....	91
3.3.3 Historical Memory.....	95
3.4 Memory and Forgiving	97
4. Identity in the Narratives	100
4.1. Producing Sense and Selfhood.....	100
4.1.1 Experience and Expression	100
4.1.2 Destiny and Event of the Destiny	105
4.1.3 Unity and Diversity of the Sense	108
4.2 Supplementary Subjects to the Topic	112

4.2.1 Experience and the System of Effects	112
4.2.2 The Horizon of Self Knowledge	115
4.2.3 Lévinas and the Alterity.....	117
4.2.4 Social Status and Mobility	122
4.2.5 Making of an Identity and Communication	123
4.3 The Unity of Life Story	128
4.3.1 Good Life – True Story.....	128
4.3.2 The Human Time and repetitiveness	138
4.3.3 The Providers of Unity	141
Conclusions	146
Bibliography	150

Keywords

identity, life story, experience, narrative identity, story, narration, event, interpretation, memory, communication

The Connection Between Narratives and Identity in the Process of Communication

Summary

The topic of the work is the analysis of the question of identity from the perspective of narratives, communication and the historiography.

The nature of identity represented such aphilosophical problem in the history of thought, which has resulted in a variety of approaches, but in all cases thinkers dealing with the issue have tried to break away from the reduction to the problem of sameness. Self-identity, as a concept tied to one person's life story, appeared in the philosophical thought only in the recent times, together with Paul Ricœur's theory of narrative identity, although antecedents date back to the Ancient Greeks.

I primarily considered it important to study the issue of identity, because this concept appears in a number of scientific fields, but the theoretical background of the term raises important issues that are appropriate for questioning related to philosophical, especially hermeneutical and phenomenological inquiries.

I have assumed that the various social sciences are working with very different definitions of identity notions, so it would be useful to find the theoretical links that connect

different identity notions to the important issues of hermeneutics and phenomenology. As the interpretation of the *narrative structure* it is possible primarily from hermeneutical and phenomenological approaches.

In society individuals and groups create events and experiences as they perform actions and these result in the reality of life lived. The life and the events experienced could not be interpretable by themselves, they would not appear in a meaningful way, as a *meaningful whole*, but through some abstraction capabilities the narrated stories would come to existence, which are always carriers of a self-identity, of an *identity* as *whole stories*. Thus, the *narrative structure* so interpreted always creates an identity.

The *central thesis* may be formulated through two interrelated thoughts. Firstly, it is necessary to examine the connection between the experience of real life and the story narrated, because the life experienced would not be meaningful by itself, but the story narrated is only considered a life history or collective story, if it is not purely fictitious, but is related to a real person with self-identity, or is related groups of persons. Secondly, individual identities certainly include a communication process as well. Stories of identity formation can only fulfill their function if, when embedded in certain communication mechanisms, not only they tell the story of themselves, but they work in a reference system, thereby validating the identity they have created. In my work I research the connections through the trace of these statements. To make this I have to clarify the place of *identity* in theoretical thinking, as well as an approach of *the philosophical term of life story*, that is relevant considering *narrative identity*.

My work is divided into four main chapters.

In the *first chapter* I try to introduce the concept of identity in order to reveal the aspects that interested me in relation to the research. I see through the concept of identity starting from its ordinary sense to its scientific use. This is necessary, because in my experience, the concept of identity in the ordinary use is very different from the one defined in theoretical texts.

Here I present the concept of *experience* in the thinking of Hegel and Gadamer, in connection with the role of it in generating the identity. In principle this is an experiment that is new, and it will totally reconstruct the previous experiences. Openness, limits and historical facts are playing a part in this, which can be spotted by a hermeneutical method.

The *second chapter* is organized around the concept of *life story*. Life stories are not only the subject of empirical researches, but also play an important role in the theory of narrative identity as well. Life story and identity is strongly connected to the concept of *life*,

and *experience* or *treat* which are based on the thoughts of Dilthey, Husserl, Gadamer, MacItyre, Tengelyi. There is in question the relationship between the lived life and the *story*, which is helped by fiction. There is a critical approach, and according to that, we can separate the life story or variation of life stories – from the lived life, on the other hand we consider that they are in unity. So what are the basis or the terms of this unity?

As long as identity examined in the context of communication can be defined in relation to community and to self-expression, life story carries the possibility of definition in connection with language, text, image, fiction and imagination. The lived life will be according to those a life story.

In the *third chapter* of my work I write about the communicative dimension of narratives. Thus, the central concept of the chapter is the idea of historicity. Issues related to memory are arranged around this idea, in particular that of collective memory. Collective memory plays an important role in the creation of individual identity, but it also reveals important lessons for the structure of individual identity, especially with regard to the ability of making abstractions, *oral history*, and the differences between communicative and cultural memory (Jan Assmann). I also refer to the notion of forgetting, since this approach is largely left out of the line of thought of *memory* and of its conceptual surrounding. In connection with *forgetting*, I assume that it is based on abstraction ability and even on necessity that allows the entire memory to exist, based on the works of Nietzsche.

In the *last chapter* of my work I would like to point out the importance of the *narrative structure in the making of an identity*. My investigations are organized around the idea that the question of identity implies the problem of self-identity and otherness, namely because the process of recollection is similar to the experiencing of the stranger, of the other. The narrative identity defined by Ricœur is based on the outlining of idem-ipse, respectively the difference between sameness and selfness. The narrated identity establishes a relation between the two. Due to the nature of the formation the story carries the identity of the character and at this level is consistent with it. However, the variability of narration, and even the almost necessarily created diversity of variants arising from the recurrent adjustments is in contrast with a supposedly real life, which is actually bringing the issue of identity into the trap of opposition of self-identity and otherness. So the question arises: in what kind of dialectics can we project the story connected to life in the context of conceptual separation and structural interconnection.

The structure of my work is organized around the problematic of priority considering the lived life and the life story, and my personal position is focused on two arguments: a) one

of them is that life story it is not possible without the imaginary, the need of abstraction is essential; b) the other is that the unity of story can be found in the narrative form, rather than in the lived life. Both are considering the force of abstraction which can be studied on the historical and cultural experiences, which is the basis for seeing something in unity, and this is the basis of communication, the medium for the constitution of identity.

I consider my investigation an *interdisciplinary* research, which, on the one hand, examines the problems of identity outlined above from *phenomenological* and *hermeneutical* perspective, on the other hand, studies the possibilities of connectivity of the identity concepts of narratives. All this is done from the point of view of communication also, the research remains in the field of philosophy, but it investigates the communication also, and is outlines other social sciences, such as history of literature, history, literary studies, anthropology, communication theory, cultural theory, and, in the context of the aforementioned *philosophical issues*.

Bibliography

- ANCSEL Éva: *Az élet mint ismeretlen történet*. Atlantisz, Budapest, 1995.
- ANDERSON, James A.: *A kommunikációelmélet ismeretelméleti alapjai*. Typotex, Budapest, 2005.
- ARISZTOTELÉSZ: *Poétika*. Irodalmi Könyvkiadó, Bukarest, 1969.
- ASSMANN, Jan: *A kulturális emlékezet*. Atlantisz, Budapest, 1999.
- BACON, Francis: *Novum Organum és Új Atlantisz*. Művelt Nép, Budapest, 1957.
- BECK, Andrew, BENNETT, Peter, WALL, Peter: *Communication Studies: The Essential Introduction*. Routledge, London and New York, 2002.
- BERGER, Peter, KELLNER, Hansried: *A kapitalista forradalom*. Gondolat, Budapest, 1992.
- BETTI, Emilio: *A hermeneutika mint a szellemtudományok általános módszertana*. In *Atheneum*, 1992. I. kötet, 2. füzet.
- BIRÓ-KASZÁS Éva: *A narratív identitás elméletei*. In *Európai, nemzeti és regionális identitás*. Debreceni Egyetemi Kiadó, Debrecen, 2011.
- BLAGA, Lucian: *Aspecte antropologice*. Facla, Timișoara, 1976.
- BUJALOS István: *A modern identitás története*. In: *Európai, nemzeti és regionális identitás*. Debreceni Egyetemi Kiadó, Debrecen, 2011.

- BUJALOS István: *Személyes és nemzeti identitás az amerikai filozófiában*. In *Európai, nemzeti és regionális identitás*. Debreceni Egyetemi Kiadó, Debrecen, 2011.
- BURKE, Peter: *Az eseménytörténet és az elbeszélés újjászületése*. In *Történetelmélet II.*, Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- CARR, Edward Hallett Carr: *Mi a történelem?* – I. In *Történetelmélet I.* Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- CROCE, Benedetto: *A történelem filozófiája*. In *Történetelmélet II.*, Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- CSEJTEI Dezső: *Elmúlás és értelem*. In *Kellék*, 2011/18,19,20.
- DÂNCU, Vasile Sebastian: *Comunicarea simbolică*. Editura Dacia, Cluj-Napoca, 1999.
- DILTHEY, Wilhelm: *A történelmi világ felépítése a szelletudományokban*. Gondolat, Budapest, 1974.
- ECO, Umberto: *Lector in fabula. Cooperarea interpretativă în texte narative*. Univers, Bucureşti, 1991.
- ECO, Umberto: *Interpretáció és történelem*. In *Történetelmélet II.*, Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- ECO, Umberto: *Nyitott mű*. Európa, Budapest, 2006.
- ELIADE, Mircea: *Aspecte ale mitului*. Univers, Bucureşti, 1978.
- FEHÉR M. István: *Martin Heidegger*. Göncöl, Budapest, 1992.
- FISKE, John: *Introduction to Communicational Studies*. Routledge, London and New York, 2003.
- FOUCAULT, Michel: *A szavak és a dolgok*. Osiris, Budapest, 2000.
- FRIEDLANDER, Peter: *Theory, method and oral history*. In *The Oral History Reader*. Routledge, London and New York. 1998.
- FRYE, Northrop: *A kritika anatómiája*. Helikon, Budapest, 1998.
- GADAMER, Hans-Georg: *Igazság és módszer*. Gondolat, Budapest, 1984.
- GAGYI József: *A kommunikatív emlékezet működéséről és a saeculumról*. In *Emlékezet és kommunikáció*. Pro Philosophia Kiadó, Kolozsvár, 2004.
- GAUDREAU, Andre: *From Plato to Lumière*. University of Toronto Press, Toronto, Buffalo, London, 2009.
- GENETTE, Gérard: *Narrative Discourse – An Essay in Method*. Cornell University Press, Ithaca – New York, 1983.
- GOFFMANN, Erving: *A hétköznapi élet szociálpszichológiája*. Gondolat, Budapest, 1981.
- GOLDIŞ, Vasile: *Despre problema naționalităților*. Editura Politică, Bucureşti, 1976.
- GRiffin, Em: *A First Look at Communication Theory*. The McGraw-Hill Comp. 2000.
- GRiffin, Em: *Bevezetés a kommunikációelméletbe*. Harmat Kiadó, Budapest, 2001.

- GRONDIN, Jean: *Bevezetés a filozófiai hermeneutikába*. Osiris, Budapest, 2002.
- HALBWACHS, Maurice: *Das kollektive Gedächtnis*. Frankfurt, 1985
- HEGEL, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich: *A szellem fenomenológiája*. Akadémiai, Budapest, 1979.
- HEIDEGGER, Martin: *Lét és idő*. Gondolat, Budapest, 1989.
- HEIDEGGER, Martin: *Principiul identității*. Crater, București, 1991.
- HEIDEGGER, Martin: *Rejtekutak*. Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- HOOPES, James: *Oral History*. The University of North Carolina Press, Chapel Hill, 1979.
- HUIZINGA, Johan: *A történelem fogalmának meghatározása*. In *Történetelmélet I.*, Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- HUSSERL, Edmund: *A fenomenológia ideája*. In *Válogatott tanulmányok*. Budapest, 1972.
- HUSSERL, Edmund: *Fenomenológia*. In *Válogatott tanulmányok*. Gondolat, Budapest, 1972.
- HUSSERL, Edmund: *The Idea of Phenomenology*. Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, 1999.
- HUSSERL, Edmund: *Karteziánus elmélkedések*. Atlantisz, Budapest, 2000.
- HUSSERL, Edmund: *Előadások az időről*. Atlantisz, Budapest, 2002.
- ISER, Wolfgang: *A fiktív és az imaginárius*. Osiris, Budapest, 2001.
- JENSEN, Klaus Bruhn: *A kommunikáció ismeretelméleti és lételeméleti szempontból*. In *Kommunikáció I*. General Press, Budapest, é.n.
- KŁOSKOWSKA, Antonia: *A társadalmi kommunikáció szituációja*. In *Kommunikáció I-II*. General Press, Budapest, é.n.
- KÖNCZEI Ádám: *A mi táncházunk*. In: *Táncház Írások az erdélyi táncház vonzásköréből*. Kriza János Néprajzi Társaság, Kolozsvár, 2004.
- KYMLICKA, Will, STRAEHLE, Christine: *Kozmopolitanizmus, nemzetállamok, kisebbségi nacionalizmus: a legújabb irodalom kritikai áttekintése*. In *Kellék 2001/17*.
- LÁSZLÓ János: *Történelem, elbeszélés, identitás*. In *A narratív identitás kérdései a társadalomtudományokban*. Gondolat-Pompeji, Budapest–Szeged, 2003.
- LEVINAS, Emmanuel: *Totalitate și infinit*. Polirom, Iași, 1999.
- LOCKE, John: *Értekezés az emberi értelemről*. Akadémiai, Budapest, 1979.
- MACINTYRE, Alasdair: *Az erény nyomában*. Osiris, Budapest, 1999.
- MACINTYRE, Alasdair: *After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory*. University of Notre Dame Press, 2007.
- MCADAMS, Dan P.: *A történet jelentése az irodalomban és az életben*. In *Narrativák 5*. Kijárat, Budapest, 2001.
- MANN, Thomas: *A varázshegy I-II*. Európa, Budapest, 1981.

- MERLEAU-PONTY, Maurice: *A látható és a láthatatlan.* L'Harmattan–Szegedi Tudományegyetem Filozófia Tanszék, Budapest, 2007.
- MUSIL, Robert: *A tulajdonságok nélküli ember.* Kalligram, Pozsony, 1995.
- NEWCOMB, Theodore M.: *A kommunikatív aktus.* In *Kommunikáció I-II.* General Press, Budapest, é.n.
- NOICA, Constantin: *Povestiri despre om.* Cartea Românească, Bucureşti, 1980.
- PAIS István: *A görög filozófia.* Gondolat, Budapest, 1982.
- PÁSZKA Imre: *Narratív történetformák.* Belvedere Meridionale, Szeged, 2007.
- PÁSZKA Imre: *Sociology of Narrative Story Forms.* Presa Universitară Clujeană, Cluj-Napoca, 2010.
- PLATÓN: *Kratílosz.* In: *Összes művei I.*, Európa, Budapest, 1984.
- PÖGELLER, Otto: *Drumul gândirii lui Heidegger.* Humanitas, Bucureşti, 1998.
- PROPP, V. J.: *A mese morfológiája.* Osiris, Budapest, 2005.
- PROUST, Marcel: *Az eltünt idő nyomában.* Európa, Budapest, 1983.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *Time and Narrative, Volume 1.* The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1984.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *Oneself as Another.* The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1992.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *Fenomenológia és hermeneutika.* Kossuth, Budapest, 1997.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *De la text la acțiune.* Echinox, Cluj, 1999.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *Válogatott irodalomelméleti tanulmányok.* Osiris, Budapest, 1999.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *Memoria, istoria, uitarea.* Amarcord, Timișoara, 2001.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *A narratív azonosság.* In *Narratívák 5.* Kijárat, Budapest, 2001.
- RICOEUR, Paul: *Az élő metafora.* Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- ROGERS, Carl R.: *Valkivé válni.* Edge 2000, Budapest, 2008.
- RÓKA Jolán: *Kommunikációtan.* Századvég, Budapest, 2005.
- ROSENGREN, Karl Erik: *Kommunikáció.* Typotex, Budapest, 2004.
- ROSS, David: *Arisztotelész.* Osiris, Budapest, 2001.
- ROSTÁS Zoltán; Stoica, Sorin: *Istorie la firul ierbii.* Tritonic, Bucureşti, 2003.
- SARBIN, Theodor R.: *Az elbeszélés mint a lélektan tő-metaforája.* In. *Narratívák 5.* Kijárat, Budapest, 2001.
- SCHLEIERMACHER, Friedrich Daniel Ernst: *Hermeneutica.* Polirom, Iași, 2001.
- SIMMEL, Georg: *A történetfilozófia problémái.* In *Történetelmélet II.*, Osiris, Budapest, 2006.
- SÓLYOM Andrea: *Ifjúsági szubkultúrák és csoportfolyamatok Székelyudvarhelyen.* In. *Csoportok és kultúrák.* Kriza János Néprajzi Társaság, Kolozsvár, 2007.

- SZIGETI, Attila: *A testet öltött másik*. Pro Philosophia, Kolozsvár, 2011.
- TAMIR, Yael: *Nemzeti identitásválasztás és a kultúrához való jog*. In *Kellék* 2001/17.
- TAYLOR, Charles: *Sources of the Self*. Harvard University Press, 1989.
- TENGELYI László: *Élettörténet és sorsesemény*. Atlantisz Kiadó, Budapest, 1998.
- TENGELYI László: *Tapasztalat és kifejezés*. Atlantisz Kiadó, Budapest, 2007.
- TODA, Masanao: *A kommunikáció fogalma*. In *Kommunikáció I-II*. General Press, Budapest, é.n.
- TORONYAI Gábor: *Életösztön és történelmi teológia Husserlnél. A fenomenológia valóságformáló lehetőségéről*. In *Kellék* 2008/36
- ULLMANN Tamás: *A francia fenomenológia kialakulása és Merleau-Ponty észleléselmélete*. In *Metropolis*, 2004/3.
- UNGVÁRI Zrínyi Imre: *Értékkommunikáció*. In *Emlékezet és kommunikáció*. Pro Philosophia Kiadó, Kolozsvár, 2004.
- VALASTYÁN Tamás: *Az identitás konstrukciója és dekonstrukciója. Shelling és Nietzsche*. In *Európai, nemzeti és regionális identitás*. Debreceni Egyetemi Kiadó, Debrecen, 2011
- VATTIMO, Gianni: *A hermeneutika eredményei*. In *Atheneum*, 1992. I. kötet, 2. füzet.
- VERESS Károly: *Az értelem értelméről*. Mentor, Marosvásárhely, 2003.
- VERESS Károly: *Sokféleség és egység a kommunikációban*. In *Pluralitás és kommunikáció*. Pro Philosophia Kiadó, Kolozsvár, 2004.
- VERESS Károly: *Közelítések az értelmező vizsgálódáshoz*. In *A határok átjárhatóságáról*. Presa Universitară Clujeană, Kolozsvár, 2006.
- VERESS Károly: *Bevezetés a hermeneutikába*. Egyetemi Műhely Kiadó, Bolyai Társaság–Kolozsvár, 2007.
- VERES Zoltán: *A filozófiai hermeneutika dialektikája és a tapasztalatfogalom átértékelődése*. In *Kellék* 2001/18-19-20.
- WEBER, Max: *A protestáns etika és a kapitalizmus szelleme*. Cserépfalvi, Budapest, 1995.
- WHITE, Hayden: *A történelem terhe*. Osiris.Gond, Budapest, 1997.
- WOLF, Virginia: *Mrs Dalloway*, Wordsworth Edition Limited, Cumberland House, 1996.